



**Review of Child Safeguarding Practice
in the ten independent
Monasteries of
The Discalced Nuns of the Order of
The Blessed Virgin Mary of Mount Carmel**

undertaken by

**The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the
Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI)**

Date: December 2015

Review of Child Safeguarding Practice – Discalced Carmelite Nuns (Cloistered)
(10 Monasteries)

CONTENTS	Page
Background	3
Introduction	4
Role Profile	5
Profile of Members	5
Policy and Procedures Document	5
Structures	5
Management of Allegations	5
Conclusion	6
Terms of Reference	7

Review of Child Safeguarding Practice – Discalced Carmelite Nuns (Cloistered)
(10 Monasteries)

Background

The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) was asked by the Sponsoring Bodies, namely the Irish Episcopal Conference, the Conference of Religious of Ireland and the Irish Missionary Union, to undertake a comprehensive review of safeguarding practice within and across all the Church authorities on the island of Ireland.

The NBSCCCI is aware that some religious congregations have ministries that involve direct contact with children while others do not. In religious congregations that have direct involvement with children, reviews of Child Safeguarding have been undertaken by measuring their practice compliance against all seven Church Standards. Where a religious congregation no longer has, or never had ministry involving children, and has not received any allegation of sexual abuse the NBSCCCI reviews are conducted using a shorter procedure. The size, age and activity profiles of religious congregations can vary significantly, and the NBSCCCI accepts that it is rational that the form of review be tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, where the ministry with children is limited or non-existent. The procedure for assessment of safeguarding practice with such congregations is set out in the contents page of this report. The NBSCCCI welcomes that in order to have full openness, transparency and accountability, religious congregations that do not have ministry with children have made requests to have their safeguarding practice examined and commented upon.

The purpose of this review remains the same and it is to confirm that current safeguarding practice complies with the standards set down within the guidance issued by the Sponsoring Bodies in February 2009 *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland* and that all known allegations and concerns had been appropriately dealt with. To achieve this task, safeguarding practice in each of these Church Authorities is reviewed through an examination of policy and procedures, and through interviews with key personnel involved both within and external to the religious congregation.

This report contains the findings of the *Review of Child Safeguarding Practice within The Discalced Nuns of the Order of the Blessed Virgin Mary of Mount Carmel*, undertaken by the NBSCCCI in line with the request made to it by the Sponsoring Bodies. This Order has ten independent monasteries in Ireland, which are affiliated in an association that provides mutual support and encouragement to the individual communities of Nuns. Rather than produce ten separate reports, it has been agreed with the Nuns through Sr. Monica Lawless, President of the Association to produce one report, as the situation in the monasteries is essentially the same.

The findings of the review have been shared with a reference group before being submitted to the ten Prioresses, along with any recommendations arising from the findings. The review is not based on a review of case material as during the relevant time period there were no allegations made against members of the Order that were within the Terms of Reference. There also were no allegations in respect of other forms of abuse within the time period, in respect of deceased and living members of the Order. The review therefore is primarily based on policies and procedures made available plus correspondence with key personnel involved in the safeguarding process within the Order. As this is an enclosed Order, no direct services are provided to the lay faithful which bring the Nuns into contact with children and young people.

Introduction

The Order operates a website at www.carmelitesisters.ie on which a detailed description of their monastic living is provided. In addition to the information available through the website, the reviewer is very grateful to Sr. Monica Lawless who, on behalf of all of the Nuns provided a lot of detail on the Order.

The roots of Carmelite Spirituality can be traced back to the Rule of St Albert, written in the 12th century for the hermits who lived on Mount Carmel at that time. When the Carmelites moved to Europe they began to take devout women under their guidance and to share with them their spiritual riches. These devout women were known as *Beguines*. The decisive point in the evolution of this type of association with the Order came in 1452, when at the request of a community of devout women following the Carmelite Rule in Florence; Pope Nicholas V issued the *Bull Cum Nulla*. This document was very significant in that it is generally accepted as the starting-point for nuns in the Carmelite Order. Blessed John Soreth was General of the Carmelite Order at the time the Papal Bull was issued. He had personally supported and promoted the place of women within the Order and so he is regarded as their founder.

In 1535 St. Teresa joined the Carmelite Nuns in Avila, Spain. As she matured in prayer she felt called by God to a renewed form of the Carmelite life. Some of the elements of this renewal were; small communities of cloistered (enclosed) nuns whose lives were directed toward prayer and contemplation of the things of God, that all would observe the Evangelical Councils (chastity, poverty and obedience) as set forth by the Primitive Rule, communities founded on solitude and silence in order to ponder the Word of God.

The Carmelite nuns came to Ireland around 1640. The first foundations were in Dublin and Loughrea. The Revolution of 1688 in England led to a period of religious intolerance, during which many of the Carmelite nuns were forced to seek refuge abroad or go into hiding. The Dublin and Loughrea nuns went into hiding in Ireland. By the early 18th century small communities had re-established themselves which included the Loughrea and Ranelagh communities. Further foundations were made over the years.

The Order today has ten monasteries in Ireland.

These are located at:

- Tallow, Co. Waterford (www.carmelitetallow.org)
- Roebuck, Dublin 14 (www.roebuckcarmel.com)
- Newry, Co. Down (www.carmelitesglenvale.org)
- New Ross, Co. Wexford (www.carmelitesnewross.com)
- Malahide, Co. Dublin (www.malahidecarmelites.ie)
- Loughrea, Co. Galway (www.loughreacarmel.com)
- Knock, Co. Mayo (www.carmelitesknock.org)
- Kilmacud, Co. Dublin (www.kilmacudcarmel.ie)
- Firhouse, Dublin 24
- Delgany, Co. Wicklow (www.carmelitemonasterydelgany.ie)

Between these 10 communities there are in total 81 Finally Professed Nuns and a further 8 Nuns in formation.

Review of Child Safeguarding Practice – Discalced Carmelite Nuns (Cloistered) (10 Monasteries)

There are 11,500 Nuns in approximately 890 Discalced Carmelite monasteries in 98 countries worldwide.

Role Profile (past and present role with children)

The Carmelite Nuns' website¹ states that:

We are called by God to live a life of prayer for the Church and for the world

The ten monasteries live the cloistered contemplative life as envisioned by St. Teresa of Avila. Their day is divided between prayer, work, study and recreation, all of which happen within the monastery and its grounds. The prayer life of the Nuns is described on the website:

*The heart of our day is the celebration of the Eucharist, and we say the full Divine Office. We also spend two hours in personal prayer each day, one in the morning and one in the evening.*²

Members of the local surrounding community are welcome to join the Nuns for daily Mass and the Prayer of the Church. People who are in need of prayer frequently visit the Carmelite monasteries to ask the Nuns to pray for them or to talk through their concerns with a member of the community.

The Nuns earn their income from baking altar breads, printing, making vestments and other religious goods, making crafts, keeping bees and the sale of religious books, as well as from donations.

Profile of Members

The largest monastery has 18 Nuns, while the smallest has three. The age range of the Nuns is from 25 years to 93 years and while the average age of the Nuns is increasing, this requires provision for Nuns who need nursing care and support. However, there are indications that younger women are being attracted to the monastic life.

Policy and Procedures Document

All of the monasteries have developed Child Safeguarding Policies, which are appropriate to their ministries. The reviewer has asked that these are displayed on the various monastery websites. In the case of the Firhouse monastery, the Nuns have suggested that their policy would be displayed on the Discalced Carmelite Nuns Association website.

Structures

Each monastery has a Prioress; and eight of the ten monasteries have a Designated Liaison Person with responsibility for child safeguarding. Two smaller communities do not have this post in operation.

The NBSCCCI has assisted the Discalced Carmelite Nuns with basic Child Safeguarding information briefings and training.

¹ www.carmelitesisters.ie/who-we-are

² Ibid

*Review of Child Safeguarding Practice – Discalced Carmelite Nuns (Cloistered)
(10 Monasteries)*

Management of Allegations and liaison with the statutory authorities

There have been no concerns, suspicions or allegations related to the Discalced Carmelite Nuns in Ireland. It has not therefore been necessary for the individual monasteries to develop and maintain working relationships with An Garda Siochana and with Tusla – the Child and Family Agency.

The Discalced Carmelite Association of Mary Mother of the Church in Ireland might give consideration to whether there would be a benefit in having a Designated Liaison Person in the two smaller monasteries who could take responsibility for communicating the Child Safeguarding message to the Nuns and for liaising with the statutory agencies and with the NBSCCCI, if required.

Conclusion:

The Discalced Carmelite Nuns have no ministry to children and they have received no child protection allegations. They are aware of their Child Safeguarding responsibilities and have appropriate policies and procedures in place.

Review of Safeguarding in the Catholic Church in Ireland

Terms of Reference (which should be read in conjunction with the accompanying Notes)

Small Religious Congregations

Introduction

In order for the National Board to be able to state that all Church Authorities on the island of Ireland have been evaluated in respect of their child safeguarding policies and practices, both historical and current, then some form of appropriate assessment has to be conducted of every one of these. It is rational however that the form of assessment is tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, and that needless expenditure of resources and unnecessary interference in the life of religious orders and communities that have no children-specific ministry would be avoided.

This Review seeks to examine the current arrangements for safeguarding children across small Religious Congregations /Orders, and Missionary Societies in Ireland who have limited or no direct contact with children as part of the Congregations ministry.

It would also scrutinize practice within all known cases to ensure that they have been responded to appropriately.

The review's methodology is an adaptation of the methodology developed for all Dioceses and large religious congregations and missionary societies, where the ministry involves regular contact with children.

The proposed Review would consider the following:-

- (a) Former role with children
- (b) Allegations of child abuse against members and how these have been responded to
- (c) Existing relationships with statutory authorities such as the HSE, Gardai in the Republic and the HSCT or PSNI in Northern Ireland.
- (d) Policies in place and being applied for safeguarding children
- (e) Roles and responsibilities and where they exist the operation of Advisory Panels, and Safeguarding Committees

The objective of the Review would be to confirm if there have been any allegations and how known allegations have been responded to; in addition the review seeks to confirm what the current arrangements for safeguarding children are. In particular, emphasis will be placed on establishing how policies and practice matches up to the standards set down in the Safeguarding Children Guidance published by the National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church launched in February 2009. Priority, at all times, will be given to how policy and practice can be improved and strengthened. If policies and/or practices are identified that are concerning, inadequate, or dangerous, they will be addressed through the provision of guidance and support, and through the reporting of these situations to the appropriate statutory authorities, if this has not already happened. Similarly, those that are good examples will be highlighted with a view to them being adopted comprehensively

Review of Child Safeguarding Practice – Discalced Carmelite Nuns (Cloistered)
(10 Monasteries)

across all parts of the Church. All cases that relate to alleged or known offenders that are alive will be read and included in the Review. In cases where the alleged or known offender is deceased, these will be sampled in an attempt to gather learning from them that will be used to inform the framing of recommendations.

Guidance Documents

The Review will be guided by the following:-

- (a) Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance;
- (b) Children First Guidance in ROI; and Regional Child Protection Guidelines in Northern Ireland;
- (c) Legislation that exists in each jurisdiction which contributes to safeguarding children and young people.

The Review will be undertaken by the National Board for Safeguarding Children through their National Office and led by the Chief Executive Officer.

The Review process will be overseen by a **Reference Group** to whom the CEO will report on a regular basis. The membership of this **Reference Group** has been drawn from each of the statutory child protection agencies in both jurisdictions, along with eminent individuals in the field from academia. The current Reference Group consists of : Dr Helen Buckley (TCD); Mr Paul Harrison (Tusla), and John Toner (SBNI).

It is important to confirm that the value of the Review is dependent upon full and complete access to all relevant documentation and information relating to the abuse of children known to the individual Church authorities. The Review will proceed on the basis that willingness exists on the part of each of the subjects of the Review to provide full access to the fieldwork team, subject, where relevant, to the terms of the Data Processing Deed agreed between the Sponsoring Bodies and entered into between the parties hereto.

Step Guide to the Review Process

Step 1.

A letter of invitation to review is sent by the Provincial/Regional Superior or other person responsible for the Congregation/ Order or Missionary Society (hereinafter referred to as ‘the Ordinary’).

Step 2.

The CEO will forward a survey to the provincial which will identify:

- Current number of members
- Past role with children
- Current role with children
- Total number of allegations received up to 2014
- Number of living members against whom there are allegations

Step 3.

For any Order where there have been allegations a full review will proceed, as per step 4 - 23. For those Orders where there have been no known allegations a desk top examination of policies and procedures will take place followed by a site visit to interview all relevant personnel within the safeguarding structure. For these orders **step 5 and 13-23** will apply.

Step 4.

The CEO and Ordinary will confirm the dates for the fieldwork for the Review, and names of the fieldwork team.

Step 5.

The Church Authority will be asked to make available all of the case files and related documentation in respect of any safeguarding concerns that have been identified within the diocese. The Church Authority will make available a room with wireless internet access for the reviewers to conduct their review of files, so that any records made by the reviewers can be directly typed and stored onto a secure server which is only accessed by the reviewers. In the absence of internet access the reviewers will type their notes onto a secure encrypted usb stick for later uploading onto the secure server.

Step 6.

The Church Authority will be requested to sign the revised Data Processing Deed prior to the arrival of the team.

Step 7.

The Church Authority will arrange a schedule of interviews with all who hold safeguarding roles within its functional area. The designated person and the Church Authority will be available to the reviewers throughout the period of fieldwork.

Step 8.

The fieldwork team when they arrive on site will firstly confirm that they have a suitable place to work in and that all the required documentation has been provided to them for their Review. In the event that the fieldwork team forms the opinion that the Church Authority has not provided access to all such documents, the Board shall give notice in writing to the Church Authority of the opinion of the fieldwork team and such notice shall specify the reasons for same. Thereupon, the Church Authority shall respond in detail to the Notice. Each party shall use its best endeavours to resolve any differences of opinion which shall arise and, in the event that resolution is not arrived at, the parties will attempt to resolve the dispute by recourse to the services of a mediator agreed between them or nominated for the purpose at the request of any of them without prejudice to the Board's entitlement to terminate the Review. In the event that resolution has not been arrived at following mediation, either party shall be at liberty to terminate forthwith the Review.

Step 9.

On arrival, the fieldwork team should be supplied with a single case file index that lists all the cases that have been created within the diocese. These may be divided into two groups. The first group will contain all allegations that relate to living alleged or known perpetrators. The second will contain any that are deceased.

Step 10.

Depending on the volume involved a decision should be made as to whether all or a random sample of the "deceased group" should be reviewed. Care should be taken to include all prominent cases in the sample.

Step 11.

Each case file will be reviewed by each fieldworker independently in the first instance. They will create a written summary with chronological information of the case. In certain cases a second reader may be required, this will be discussed and agreed between the fieldworkers.

Step 12.

Following the reading of the case and the creation of a summary, the fieldworkers will analyse and assess the actions taken in the case. They will assess compliance with agreed Church policy that was extant at that time. They will also indicate whether any current risk exists in respect of the information contained within the file and advise the church Authority of necessary safeguarding action to reduce the risk.

Step 13.

When all the case files have been read, the fieldwork team will then examine and review any procedures or protocols that exist within the diocese to confirm that they are in compliance with the *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance* document issued by the NBSCCCI in February of 2009.

Step 14.

To complete the Review, the fieldwork team will then seek to speak to those directly involved in the safeguarding structure in the diocese. This should include the Advisory Panel, a sample of parish safeguarding representatives, the designated person, the safeguarding committee, victim support and advisors and the Bishop/Provincial. The purpose of these interviews is to form a view of the competence and effectiveness of the safeguarding structure that exists within the Church Authority.

Step 15.

The fieldwork team will also seek to speak to representatives of the key statutory agencies to provide them with an opportunity to express their views on the quality of the working relationships that exist between them and the Church Authority.

Step 16.

A verbal feedback session on initial key findings will be given to the Church Authority.

Step 17.

Upon completion of the field work, the team may request to take materials – other than casework records to review off-site; this alongside all materials gathered by the reviewers, including written notes on cases and meetings, will be analysed and will form the basis of the draft assessment review report.

Step 18.

The draft will be forwarded to the Church Authority for factual accuracy checking.

Step 19.

Alongside all other reports under review, the report will be presented in draft to the Reference Group for their critique and comment. If further work is required at the direction of the Reference group the CEO will ensure this work is completed and advise the Church Authority accordingly.

Step 20.

The report will be legally proofed by NBSCCCI lawyer.

Step 21.

The report will be forwarded to the National Board for approval

Step 22

A final draft report will then be submitted to the Church Authority. The expectation would be that the Report will be published by the Church Authority at an agreed time in the future.

Step 23.

All case material written, including summaries, as part of the review, which are for the reviewers use only, will be stored on a secure server.

Guide for Reviewers

In terms of small (female religious orders) reference should be made to the following:

1. Has the Order provided alternative care to children in an orphanage, industrial school or children's residential home, but no longer is engaged in running such services;
2. Has the order provided education to children, in both or either boarding schools and day schools, but no longer does so ;
3. Has the order provided medical and/or nursing services to children, but no longer does so;
4. Has the order provided any other services to children, in community services centres, youth clubs etc., and no longer does so;
5. Does the order currently provide any sort of service to children and families that brings them into regular contact with children;
6. Has the order never provided any service to children (e.g. contemplative orders).

In relation to category 1 above;

1. The reviewers will establish whether any service they provided is included in the list of children's residential services produced by the Residential Institutions Redress Board (RIRB);
2. If this is the case, reference should be made to this.
3. If complaints have been referred to the Redress Board or Ryan Commission, this review cannot access these records and that will be stated in the report.
4. If the order has received complaints which have not been processed through Redress or Ryan these cases will be thoroughly examined as detailed above.

Review of Policy and Procedures

1. It is recognised that not all Orders will have any ministry with children and therefore their policies and procedures should reflect the work that they do with children.
2. If the Order only works through other organisations, example in Diocesan work or in schools, they are required to follow the policies of those organisations.
3. If there are gaps in the policy document an assessment should be made as to whether the ministry engaged in requires full compliance with all criteria attached to the seven standards
4. Where it is clear that the criteria do not apply a reference should be made at the beginning of the review report that the Order's ministry is not directly with children and therefore adherence to particular criteria do not apply.
5. In the Order is a contemplative Order, there is no expectation that they will have detailed policies and procedures, but reference should be made to their ministry and that they have no contact with children.
6. In all cases, contact will be made with the civil authorities to identify if they have any child safeguarding concerns in relation to the order.